



Brice and De Bohun, Duncan, John, 1866–1945, Photo credit: The Sterling Smith Art Gallery & Museum

Scotland and Nationalism: cultural and political aspects of Scottish identity from the medieval period to the present

7^{et} 8
octobre
2021

Au Logis du Roy
Square Jules Bocquet, Amiens

9
octobre
2021

Pôle Citadelle
Rue des Français libres, Amiens

✉ Organised by Dr. Clarisse Godard Desmarest: clarisse.godarddesmarest@u-picardie.fr

🌐 <https://sfecorpus.sciencesconf.org>

BOOK of ABSTRACTS

Prof. Ian Brown, Kingston University, ‘Scottishness’: Performativity and the Performance of National Identities

Brown’s new book, *Performing Scottishness: Enactment and National Identities* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2020) explores a variety of ways in which, over the centuries, conceptions of Scottishness (alongside Englishness and Britishness) has been performed and modified. This paper draws in particular on the historical politics of the promotion and suppression of different languages within Scotland and on Scottish scholars’ development of the discipline of ‘English Literature’ as part of the Scottish Enlightenment and the post-Treaty of Union Hanoverian settlement. It explores how these two developments, alongside others, contributed, on the one hand, to what has been called the ‘Scottish Cringe’ and, on the other, to an assertive Scottish identity both within a unionist context and, more recently, in the rise of the movement to reestablish Scottish independence.

Prof. Pamela King, University of Glasgow, *Cherchez la femme: The Problem of Absent and Occluded Women’s Voices in Early Scots*

‘Smeddum’, one of many Scots words that defies translation, is glossed by the actions of Margaret Menzies, the protagonist of Lewis Grassie Gibbons’ short story of the same name, vigorous under duress. Between 2015 and 2017 the three major political parties in the Scottish Parliament were all led by women. Nichola Sturgeon, Ruth Davidson, and Kezia Dugdale all display smeddum, because Scotland, traditionally a land of heavy industry and soldiering, has also generated the popular archetype of the Scots male, as unabashedly sexist but living in fear of ‘her indoors’.

Early Scots writing underscores a *Braveheart* picture of a proud national culture that is designed for and defended by men. John Barbour’s *Bruce* and Blind Hary’s *Wallace*, are unreflectingly phallogocentric, and three of the best known poets, Robert Henryson, William Dunbar, and Gavin Douglas were all in holy orders and display incipient gynophobic tendencies. The strongest representations of women in the corpus are burlesque, with the exception of *The Kingis Quair*, whose author, thoroughly acculturated in the English/French tradition by happenstance, barely counts.

The project of *cherchez la femme* in early Scots writing has focused productively on the poetry in the so-called Maitland Quarto, (Cambridge: Magdalene College, Pepys Library 2553). A collection emanating from a literary family provides auspicious grounds for seeking a female voice, but a debate about critical approaches has ensued: does the critic accept that the tradition of ventriloquising the female voice in the period invalidate attributions to real female writers, or, following Evelyn Newlyn, should the critic adopt a “transgressive” reading resisting assumptions of male authorship? In this paper I return to the Maitland Quarto to identify in the manuscript’s ordering, sections where male and female voices are arranged in dialogue, constructing a hypothetical competitive writing game within the private world of a Scottish gentry family.

Dr. Annette Bächstädt, Université de Reims Champagne Ardenne, Scotland the “male” nation?

This paper will argue that the minority and long absence of Mary, Queen of Scots, enhanced by the regency (1554-1560) of her mother, the queen dowager Marie of Lorraine, fostered the definition of Scotland and the Scots as a distinctive “male” nation. George Buchanan goes as far as theorizing a Scottish exception and deliberately promotes the ‘unscottishness’ of female rule, writes Armel Dubois-Nayt. According to Lisa Hopkins, “there was no trouble whatsoever about the recognition of the baby Mary as queen” [HOPKINS, 2002, p. 31]. Even though no one openly contested James V’s daughter’s legitimacy, efforts were made to get rid of the deceased king’s only heir, by marriage or otherwise. John Lisle and Cuthbert Tunstall, bishop of Durham, write in a letter to king Henry VIII of England in 1543 that “Skotland [...] desire[s] to have a kinge amonges theym selves for their owne wealthe as they have always had”. In his *History of Scotland* (1759), William Robertson still describes the Scots as a “martial people”. This testifies to the vividness of the Scottish identity myth of a nation ruled from time

immemorial by an indigenous, male and unbroken royal lineage which dates back to the time of the Declaration of Arbroath (1320). Yet, Scotland is governed today by Nicola Sturgeon (SNP), the first woman appointed First Minister of Scotland in 2014, who energetically promotes Scottish independence. Does 'scottishness' still mean masculinity, and does the Scottish cultural and political nationalism still need a female villain?

Joanna Richardson, University of Edinburgh, A shared Irish ancestry?: defining the medieval Scottish community in John Barbour's *The Bruce*

John Barbour's *The Bruce* (c.1375) is a canonical work of Scottish literature and the most comprehensive account of the Scottish Wars of Independence which occurred at the turn of the fourteenth century (events that continue to resonate in discussions of Scottish identity today). Barbour's famous employment of the language of 'freedom' to retell Robert Bruce's gaining of the Scottish crown emphasises (alongside the equally famous Declaration of Arbroath) the importance of the Scottish community in Robert's ascendancy. Interestingly Barbour also chooses to give considerable space in his work to recount the conquest of Ireland in 1315-1318 by Robert's brother Edward Bruce. This conquest has been noted by historians such as Seán Duffy for its appeal to older cultural ideas of a shared ancestry between Scotland and Ireland. The 'Irish Remonstrance' (written to the Pope on behalf of the Irish in 1317) in particular emphasised Edward as a worthy defender of the Irish community's rights as one who shared the ancestry of this community. Whilst this language was prominent in literary justification of the conquest instigated by the Bruces and their supporters in Ireland, it is not mentioned at all by Barbour in his account of these events. Given Barbour's emphasis on community identity and its importance in sustaining and validating Robert's claim in Scotland, the absence of these ideas in the Irish section of his work is notable and requires some explanation. This paper will draw on in-depth analysis of Barbour's text to explore the way he understands this early formation of Scottish national identity. It will also suggest how *The Bruce* fits into wider movements to develop a Scottish community identity in this period (both culturally and politically) which, as historians such as Dauvit Broun and others have highlighted, increasingly appears to exclude older ideas of shared Irish ancestry.

Clément Guézais, Université de Caen Normandie – University of St Andrews, Effets indésirables : Réflexions sur « l'antidote » écossais

Pour souligner le succès des Écossais à la bataille de Bauge en 1421, le chroniqueur Walter Bower attribua au pape Martin la remarque suivante : « vraiment, les Écossais sont un antidote aux Anglais ». Au cours des Guerres d'Indépendance, l'opposition avec l'Angleterre était devenue une composante centrale du développement de l'imaginaire national écossais. Ce processus se renforça durant la guerre de Cent Ans, où il adopta une portée internationale favorisée notamment par l'alliance avec la France et l'intervention directe des Écossais sur le continent au XV^e siècle. L'hostilité proverbiale avec le voisin anglais était un élément de distinction qui avait des avantages indéniables sur le plan idéologique, mais qui comportait aussi des risques. Cette présentation sera l'occasion de revenir rapidement sur les enjeux de cet antagonisme et sur ses bénéfices côté écossais à la fin du Moyen Âge. Pour aller plus loin et explorer de nouvelles pistes, on va étudier cette configuration par le biais de discours français contemporains. Si l'antidote est un remède, son existence et sa légitimité sont limitées par le rapport exclusif et étroit avec le poison qu'il doit combattre. Que ce soit en Écosse ou sur le continent, les observateurs ont souvent eu un regard critique à l'égard de la relation curieuse qui unissait les Écossais aux Anglais. Dans le spectacle de la furie meurtrière et de la dévastation des royaumes, le pacte de haine entre l'Écosse et l'Angleterre créait entre les deux adversaires une dérangeante proximité. Versant plus sombre de la Vieille Alliance, ces propos permettent à la fois de mesurer le succès symbolique des Écossais dans leur effort de singularisation et le malaise occasionné en France, présentée comme un corps malade et vulnérable. Un avertissement semble se dégager de l'ensemble : les royaumes qui renoncent à la paix pour se définir dans leurs haines mutuelles sont voués à la destruction.

Dr. Bryony Coombs, University of Edinburgh, Creating Identities: Tracing the Transfer of a Scottish Origin Myth from Scotland to France c. 1519

By tracing the patronage of Scots in France in the early-sixteenth century much can be ascertained regarding Franco-Scottish knowledge networks and concepts of national identity. This talk brings together two manuscripts; one in Paris and one in Glasgow. Scribal notes on the flyleaves of the Glasgow manuscript indicate that it travelled to France in the early-sixteenth century with the important French herald, Montjoie. Archival evidence allows us to reconstruct the circumstances of this diplomatic errand. Furthermore, literary analysis demonstrates that the Glasgow manuscript was used by a French scribe as the source for his French translation of this text, now held in Paris. An extraordinary visual genealogy, furthermore, appended to the Paris manuscript provides important evidence for understanding how Scottish national identity was viewed and used, at both a social and political level. This case study provides important, and hitherto unexplored, evidence for the transfer of ideas between Scotland and France. The translation of this material into French, and its reworking into a visual format, is key to our understanding of Franco-Scottish relations during this period. While the subject of this talk is a specific case-study of the transfer and translation of literary material, it allows us to consider much broader questions relating to Scottish national identity at the turn of the sixteenth century. The conversion of this material into visual form, furthermore, demonstrates what aspects of Scottish national identity were most highly prized by Scots in France at this time. This research allows us to analyse how a powerful, if fictitious, origin myth was employed by elite Scots in relation to forging identities and bolstering political power.

Dr. Calum S. Wright, Birkbeck, Presbyterianism, conscience and political thought in Scotland, c. 1637-1653

Between 1637 and 1660 the nations of the British Isles were roiled by conflict. These struggles of arms were accompanied by contests of ideas, values and beliefs, shaped by the institutional and cultural peculiarities of the countries involved. In turn, these differences undermined efforts to reach a stable peace settlement and to establish a new British commonwealth during the 1650s. In this paper I will focus on the concept of conscience in order to explore how Presbyterianism shaped Scottish political thought in distinctive ways. When Scots invoked conscience, the context of its exercise — a Presbyterian system of discipline — was assumed. When they spoke of liberties, they meant the freedom of the individual within this discipline, and the freedom of the country's representative institutions from monarchical control. These ideas contrasted with arguably more individualistic notions of conscience which emerged in England at the same time. This is not to say that Scottish political thought was static or monolithic, but rather to suggest that ideas are shaped by the context in which they emerge, develop and are articulated. I will explore the relationship between ecclesiology and political thought across the period 1637-1653, touching on the Scottish National Covenant and the English Protestation oath; the deliberations of the Westminster Assembly of Divines; and the Scottish Engagement crisis of the early 1650s. This paper will explore the question of whether there was a distinctively Scottish political culture the mid seventeenth century and what implications this might have had for the development of national identity.

Prof./Sir Tom Devine, University of Edinburgh, The Death and Reinvention of Scotland within the Union State

Dominic Grieve QC: Does the UK have a future?

Prof. Aonghus MacKechnie, University of Strathclyde, Replicas and revivals: a Scottish miscellany

Narratives of Scotland's architectural history have presented and discussed styles, fashions, trends, and the impacts both at home and externally of the country's participation within the 'Western' cultural community. All this aligns with the established orthodoxies of identifying a national architectural culture, noting changing fashions, and contextualising it all relative, especially, to the neighbours. Within Scotland, and distinct from these generalities, a new trajectory was sometimes sparked by decidedly 'local' factors. These were directly Scotland-specific topics: encompassed within the norms of the wider paradigms, of course, but moulded to suit the particular Scottish requirements of a particular moment. The result was a selective appropriation of epitomizing models, native or otherwise, considered sufficiently valuable to merit presentation, re-emphasis, and provision of a new life in a new age.

This generally resulted in sites other than the original being chosen for the new 'old', because the value of the message typically outweighed that of locational authenticity, and the message was obviously more transportable. The viewer, to their intellectual profit, could be symbolically transported to the hallowed site from where the builders' messages were now re-broadcast.

One course chosen was therefore through metaphor. This could comprise a revival in modified form, as with the symbolically-martial Baronial castles with their dummy gunholes. Alternatively, and more transparently, the desired symbolism could be provided through replica. Examples of both these processes are highlighted in this paper. A distinction is proposed between situations where public messages were calculated for broadcast through for example spectacularization, as with Edinburgh's early 19th century churches, or more privately, through a personalised re-visiting of perceived icons. It is suggested that not one, nor two, but three versions of a national(ist) politics is seen through Scottish architectural choices – formulae signalling Scotland, signalling Britain, and distinct from both of these, signalling, thirdly, an Anglo-UK.

Kristel van Soeren, Utrecht University, Collective Identities and the *Other* in Scottish Jacobite Songs

Songs and music are invaluable sources for the study of national and cultural identities in any given society. These sources tell the stories of marginal communities that oftentimes are overshadowed or dismissed by the more dominant historical narratives. Music can be used not only to distinguish the Self from the Other but also to maintain this distinction. This becomes overtly clear in the study of Scottish Jacobite song culture. A consideration of songs and music would contribute greatly to the study of national identities. However, musical sources have often been neglected by historians.

In this paper, I analyse how collective identities were articulated in the early eighteenth-century Jacobite songs 'Whurry Whigs Awa' and 'O My Bonnie Highland Laddie'. Literary scholars and historians have often considered Jacobite songs as texts rather than *songs*, neglecting the crucial musical aspects. I argue that studying both the text and the music is essential as music can carry cultural and national identities. In my case studies, I look at themes of loyalty and patriotism and the depiction of the English. I examine how the concept of Us and Them is embedded in the songs and how this strengthened the bond with Jacobite followers. For this, I look at Martin Stokes' work on music and identity and Philip Bohlman's work on cultural identity, national and nationalist music. With an intertextual analysis, I argue that the active and conscious distinguishing from the Other helped to strengthen the feeling of collective identity and thus played a significant role in forming a Scottish national identity. Ultimately, this paper will demonstrate how musicological research on these songs can reveal valuable information on the role of these songs in the formation of Scottish national identity in the eighteenth century, the political concerns of the lower classes, and the musical practice.

Dr. Clarisse Godard Desmarest, University of Picardie Jules Verne, James Macpherson's *Ossian* and the construction of the French nation under Napoleon

This presentation considers anew Napoleon's interest in James MacPherson's *Ossian*, and in particular the two great paintings of Ossianic subjects by Girard and Girodet commissioned around 1800 by Joséphine de Beauharnais for his residence at Malmaison. I will seek to show how these works—and perhaps even Napoleon's curious predilection for *Ossian* itself—formed part of a self-consciously

manipulative propaganda campaign that was simultaneously intended to generate a new and compelling ethnic identity for the French nation while consolidating Napoleon's position at its head. Framing this campaign within longstanding debates on the origins and identity of the French, I will explore how the cult of *Ossian* and the wider Celtic revival under the Directoire, Consulate and Empire provided a means of overcoming the oppositional politics implicit in *ancien régime* debates about relative importance of the Gallo-Roman and Germanic contributions to France's history. In doing so, *Ossian* also provided the basis for a unifying narrative that extended beyond French borders to embrace Napoleon's wider imperial ambitions in Italy and beyond. This programme, implicit in the iconography of the Malmaison paintings, then gained a new life in 1804-5, as Napoleon sought to establish himself as the rightful heir and recreator of the Roman Empire, not only in its ancient, but also its medieval and more recent incarnations.

Thomas Archambaud, University of Glasgow and Université Paris-Sorbonne, The Return of the Native: James Macpherson, British India and the transformations of the Highland landscape

This paper examines a neglected facet of the life of James Macpherson (1736-1796), the 'translator' of *Ossian*. After the Treaty of Paris in 1763, Macpherson first worked as a political writer defending Lord North's administration during the American crisis. He then shifted to the East India Company and worked as private agent for the Nawab of Arcot, a Mughal prince in Bengal. His patronage networks enabled him to promote kinsmen and relatives in the British army and the East India Company for more than twenty years.

Coming back to his native county of Badenoch, in the Highlands of Scotland, Macpherson became in the 1780s a very prosperous proprietor whose wealth was derived from India. As an MP in Westminster, he successfully used his position to obtain the restoration of the clan Macpherson's estates which were forfeited after Culloden. This did not represent a return to the *status quo*, however. James's Neo-Palladian mansion, built by the brothers Adam shows to what extent imperial money and a sense of 'displaced Scottishness' transformed the Highlands. Born in a relatively modest family, James's large land purchases placed him in a far better position than the clan chief himself. His management model also offers an interesting example of *improvement* and an alternative to the *clearances* conducted by his neighbours. Furthermore, Macpherson was also instrumental in re-rooting Gaelic and traditional culture in the Badenoch landscape, or to use P. Basu's words, 'a Macpherson landscape'. The 'Ossianisation' of the topography was part of a strategy of economic modernisation - facilitated by the large influx of colonial money - and political rehabilitation through a myth-making serving the purposes of Highland army recruitments.

Macpherson's success as a landowner and patron uncovers a more active and pragmatic role played by Highlanders themselves in the redefinition of Anglo-Scottish relations. It also highlights the importance of British India in the transformations of the Scottish Highlands in the 18th-century.

Robin Baillie, University of Lincoln and the National Galleries of Scotland, Performing the contradictions of the 'National' in Scottish History Painting, 1830 - 1855

This paper investigates the formative role played by Scottish history painters in the first half of the nineteenth century in developing a national narrative. It will demonstrate how recent historiographical and literary studies (Rigney, 2001, Duncan, 2007, McCracken-Flesher, 2005, Lincoln, 2007,) exploring Walter Scott's novels can produce new insights when directed towards Scottish history painting. Scott's creation of a sophisticated and contradictory field of signs to produce a contemporary Scottish identity - via a simultaneous investment in the Scottish past - formed the symbolic lexicon through which Scottish artists visualised the nation's past. This translation from novel to canvas was a fraught process, which risked devaluation in both aesthetic and historiographical terms, but it was also a key site of the theatrical production of national identity.

The paper will examine history paintings by David Wilkie William Allan, George Harvey and James Drummond, which depict scenes directly inspired by Scott's re-encoding of historical personalities and events in Scotland's past. This set of imaginary procedures, which allowed the nation to be narrated and

history to be seen as an expression of national identity, was mirrored in the production of history paintings which were selected to form the 'national school' in the National Gallery of Scotland. My investigation will show how these paintings override their contradictory assemblage of antiquarian relics, painstaking mimesis and melodramatic gesture to become unifying 'national' works of art. The 'virtuality' of the Scottish past was produced as an aesthetic effect. History painting's viewers could achieve the twin goals of producing their own subject identities, while being conjoined in a process of national production, which overcame the divisions of taste, status and class. This paper will assert that these paintings signify the centrality of the 'national' project of identity production in nineteenth century Scotland, as a means to negotiate social and political power.

Dr. Anthony Lewis, Glasgow Museums, Glasgow Museums and the presentation of Scottish identity through Jacobite collections and displays.

This paper reviews the Jacobite collection of objects held by Glasgow Museums as an example of how a cultural service accommodates intersecting interests of its users in history and politics. The collection's historical development and display mirrors the popularity of Scottish history stimulated by myth, education and politics. The collection has been developed under the governance of Glasgow councilors via purchases by professional museum staff and donations. It is stored and displayed and enquiries from visitors and researchers follow. These develop a deeper understanding of the collections for both the enquirers and service staff.

The review is based upon three elements. Firstly, setting the Jacobite collection with a historical setting to indicate the international dynamics of the movement in Europe, England, Ireland and Scotland itself and its reaction to crises of the Stuart's loss of power. The movement's material culture can represent its support from all these areas. Within Scotland objects can represent both Highland and Lowland followers whether they be urbane patricians set in dining rooms or rural chiefs and soldiers gathered by their flags ready for war and waiting for a French army to land with soldiers and supplies on board. Secondly, this civic collection will be placed into a chronological narrative running from the 1890s to 1940s. This accounts for Glasgow's International Exhibitions of 1888, 1901 and 1938 and crises of imperial and catastrophic international wars. This collection history will be contrasted to recent display history from the 1990s to 2000s when plebiscites for Scottish devolution gave Jacobite displays increased agency to contrast the historical aims of the movement with a widening contemporary debate about independence and wider international recognition for Scottish identity.

Thirdly, the advent of a new Burrell collection museum to open in Glasgow has allowed Sir William Burrell's biography and collection to be reassessed. Sir William Burrell can now be shown to be a collector with clear interests in history. This included Scottish history which manifested in collections about Stuart monarchs and included Jacobite objects. Sir William Burrell's political career in Conservative and unionist politics provide further historical contexts through which to understand his motivations for collecting, his curation of 1901 international exhibition displays and later donations to Glasgow's collections.

Maike Dinger, Universities of Stirling and Strathclyde, The 2014 Scottish independence referendum and arts-based campaigning for self-government

In popular memory, the 2014 referendum on Scottish independence has become synonymous with arts-based activism and grassroots engagement. Apparent success in mobilising 'forgotten' segments of the national community has often been traced to the dynamism of Scottish *cultural* activism and continues to be framed in terms of a grassroots festival of democracy, creativity and political participation in the media.

Both the emphasis on the role of artistic commitment to increasing measures of self-determination and the sense that Scotland is marked by a 'more' equal and democratic society (than England), so the argument of this paper, are at least partially based on narratives of national identity. While the former seemingly builds on continuities from the previous referendums on Scottish devolution, the latter evokes

sentiments popularly associated with the Scottish Enlightenment rather than, strictly speaking, current political realities.

Therefore, this paper aims to demonstrate that the convulsion of national art and culture with ‘politics of independence’ did not only shape the recent discourse on Scottish independence and opinion-making processes in the public sphere, but ties in with Scottish self-identification and with traditional theorisations of nationalism and nation-building processes. In line with this, this paper argues that the ‘narration of the nation’, that strikingly manifests at the intersection of the literary and political, shaped a contemporary ‘myth’ of participation and democracy in 2014, written in (elite) media discourses and echoed in Scottish poetry and fiction.

This cultural practice of myth-making will be explored by discussing the role of arts-based activism during the 2014 referendum campaign and by analysing continuities and ruptures with previous arts-based and literary campaigning for further levels of Scottish self-determination. Materials detailing literary and media representations of ‘popular participation’ and arts-based activism will be (historically) contextualised and compared to first-hand accounts of participants in the cultural referendum debate.

Dr. Pierre-Louis Coudray, Montpellier 3 University, *Nemo me impune lacessit*

As the electoral map of Scotland turned decidedly yellow after the victory of the SNP (Scottish National Party) in the Scottish Parliament elections on the 6th of May 2021, the victory of a pro-independence party in that country might further weaken an already embattled United Kingdom fighting against a global pandemic. During the months leading to the campaign, the debate not only addressed topics directly relevant to devolution and sanitary conditions, but also questions regarding military history alongside current defence matters. More particularly, the rumour in late 2020 of the impending disbandment of the most famous Highlander regiment, the Black Watch, sparked a conversation on what was perceived as a direct threat to Scottish identity. Interestingly, the recent British army restructuring reforms of Scottish units have been happening simultaneously with the rise of the SNP. This calls for an exploration of the importance of Scotland’s military past in the on-going debate about a possible second independence referendum.

In the popular mind, the instantly recognisable silhouette of the Scottish soldier is clearly associated with Britain and yet the history of Scottish units fighting for London is paradoxical, with their rebellious nature threatening the very survival of the Hanoverian regime before turning them into loyal servants of the Empire. How did this happen, and how is this still relevant in the 21st century as Scotland and Britain question their respective military histories as well as their political futures? Whether celebrated or feared throughout the world as an outstanding warrior, the Scottish soldier became a powerful symbol no one on either side of the debate on independence can ignore. This paper will analyse both the military image of Scottish soldiers fighting for Britain for the past three centuries and how that historical background still echoes through discussions concerning Scotland as a nation in the wake of its 2021 elections.

Prof. Ugo Bruschi, University of Bologna, Highland Garb Grabbing the Headlines? Echoes in the Scottish Press of the Punitive Legislation after Culloden

Among the consequences of the Jacobite defeat at Culloden was the passing of laws aimed at curbing the military threat posed by Highland clans and at breaking down little by little the foundations of Highland culture. There had already been precedents in the aftermath of previous unsuccessful Jacobite uprisings (such as the disarming acts of 1716 and 1725), but the punitive laws passed by Parliament in 1746 brought this policy to a new level. The Heritable Jurisdictions Act seriously damaged the power base of the clans, by striking at the judicial rights held by the chieftains. The Act of Proscription, in addition to reinforcing the measures of the disarming acts, tried to erase Highland culture, especially in the notorious provisions forbidding ‘within that part of Great Briton called Scotland’ to ‘wear or put on the clothes commonly called Highland Clothes’, as well as the use of ‘tartan, or partly-coloured plaid or stuff’ for ‘great coats, or for upper coats’. The Heritable Jurisdiction Acts survived virtually unscathed until the repeals and reforms of the Victorian age, whereas the ban on the Highland dress was lifted in 1782. The punitive laws of 1746 can be understood as an attempt at cancelling the identity of

highlanders. It is open to question how far this effort was successful; on the other hand, it has been underlined that the new measures had the side effect of affecting also clans that had proved their loyalty to the Hanoverian dynasty. Investigating how this attack on the clan system and Highland culture was received in the public sphere is the aim of this paper. In particular, it will focus on how the Scottish press of the time reacted to the legislation passed after Culloden and how it greeted its partial repeal in 1782.

Dr. Terence McBride, Open University, Scottishness and ‘Foreignness’: The Role of the Scottish Office, 1885-1939

Scotland by the late nineteenth century had become one of Europe’s most industrialised and urbanised societies. Certain categories of migrants from continental Europe had also begun to take up residence in cities like Glasgow, Edinburgh and Dundee. From 1905, as a result of central government policies, these migrants were increasingly subject to a more stringent system of controls on entry, ever-increasing documentary surveillance and more explicit administrative management of their presence. State institutions located mostly in Edinburgh and, from 1885, the London-based Scottish Office (answerable to a ‘Secretary for Scotland’) had a whole range of powers over matters deemed to be ‘Scottish’. Although the establishing Act of 1885 had not given the Secretary for Scotland any explicit responsibility for matters relating to ‘aliens’ or foreign affairs and it was therefore understood that a UK Cabinet ministers retained such authority, UK-wide policies on matters such as internment and deportation were in practice subject to decisions by this Scottish machinery of government. For migrants, there was now a machinery of government in place that could express an official ‘Scottish’ approach to ‘foreignness’, observable in terms of principles expressed, priorities adopted or procedures followed. This paper aims to briefly demonstrate that the Scottish Office during WW1 and the interwar period, in line with the growing political remit of the Secretary for Scotland and the growing administrative capacity of the machinery, not only had occasion to deal with aliens in its own distinct way but also continued to develop and assert its capacity to do so.

Prof. Robert Anderson, University of Edinburgh, G. E. Davie’s Democratic Intellect in context

George Davie’s book *The Democratic Intellect: Scotland and her universities in the nineteenth century* (1961) was a key influence on the development of cultural nationalism in the 1960s-70s. This paper will not directly explore that influence, or discuss the historical validity of Davie’s account. The aim is rather to place his book in the general context of university history. The 1950s and 1960s were a period of intense university discussion in Britain (the Robbins report, the ‘two cultures’ controversy, etc.), and the paper asks what influence Davie had outside Scotland. It will discuss the sources from which he drew his interpretation, and his work’s context in the wider history of universities in the 19th and 20th centuries. His focus on ‘specialisation’ relates to the professionalization of university disciplines under German influence, and the problems which this raised for undergraduate teaching and liberal education. The history of other arts disciplines, and parallels with the status of philosophy in France, provide further comparative contexts. Within Scotland, Davie’s book had more academic impact on sociologists than historians, raising as it did general questions of national identity. Finally, the paper suggests why post-war developments created a receptive atmosphere for a book which was by no means easy to read and on a somewhat esoteric subject.

Stephen O’Rourke QC, The creation of the National Library of Scotland

Stephen O’Rourke, Keeper of the Advocates Library, Edinburgh, will give a presentation on the history and creation of The National Library of Scotland and of the adjoining Advocates Library. Beginning with the foundation of the Advocates Library in Parliament House in 1682 and its development into a legal deposit library early in the 18th Century, Stephen will trace the growth of the Advocates Library under the care of Keepers such as David Hume and Adam Ferguson during the Enlightenment period,

at which time it was the premier academic resource in the country. Stephen will then pick up the growth of the Advocates Library collection through the 19th and into the early 20th Century, leading eventually to the creation in 1925 of The National Library of Scotland out of the Advocates Library collection.

Prof. Nathalie Duclos, University of Toulouse2, The Scottish independence movement: national or nationalist?

The aim of this study is to investigate the nature of what is described in every-day language as the Scottish “independence movement”. As a movement made up of a network of organisations and individuals, the Scottish independence movement was born in the twenty-first century and developed significantly on the occasion of the 2014 Scottish independence referendum. Though often presented as a ‘nationalist’ movement, it now includes many organisations and individuals who reject such a label. Nationalist movements have been defined as movements whose ‘central goal’ is ‘the pursuit, through constitutional reforms of otherwise, of degrees of political self-determination when it does not exist, or of greater degrees of it when already present’ (Pinard 2020). This definition raises several questions. First, can independence be described as the ‘central goal’ of all the major organisations which make up the Scottish independence movement? The first part of this study offers a comparative analysis of the way independence is presented by these organisations and their main actors. Such an analysis reveals an internal tension within the movement between a nationalist belief in independence as a worthy goal in and of itself and in the need to prioritise independence over other issues, and an instrumental vision of independence as a necessary step to another, more central goal (be that socialism, social justice or ecologism). Second, can we speak of an independence ‘movement’ if all that its members share is a common goal? Social movement literature insists on the need for movement actors to share not just a common goal, but also common beliefs and a common value-system. Do the organisations described as being part of the Scottish ‘independence movement’ share a common belief in the nationalist value-system? The second part of this study looks into how ‘nationalism’ is perceived and presented by different actors in the Scottish independence movement. The study concludes that, rather than a nationalist movement, the Scottish independence movement is best described as a ‘national’ movement.

Dr. Arnaud Fiasson, University of Toulouse, Undermining the established order: Scottish cultural and political nationalism in the twentieth century

The progressive development of Scottish nationalism in the 20th century was underpinned by the coexistence of multiple nationalist individuals and organisations voicing cultural and political demands. Although this paper does not presume to offer an exhaustive analysis of the nationalist movement, it explores the extent to which national sentiment has been politically articulated so as to challenge the central state. It will be shown that nationalist claims have rested on the perception that the British state is no longer able to ensure the protection of Scottish cultural and political interests.

Scottish artists played a crucial role in defining Scottish identity. Similarly to Robert Burns and Walter Scott, the use of the languages of Scotland by writers represented an act of cultural resistance. This was manifest in the case of the writers of the Scottish Renaissance in the 1920s and 1930s, as they were more or less associated with nationalist organisations. Interestingly, the nationalist movement had its own political dissenters who disagreed on how best to achieve their goals. In the first half of the 20th century, these goals ranged from home rule to independence before they regrouped under the banner of the SNP. In the 1960s and 1970s, the electoral strategy of the SNP was in stark contrast to extremist organisations which operated outside the legal framework. These dissenting organisations adopted a clandestine position, either by supporting campaigns of civil disobedience, or by using violent means of action. They showed that national sentiment was able to grow outwith the institutions that exercised authority and beyond the parties that conformed to the established political order.

For later Scottish writers and intellectuals, the search for a Scottish voice remained a central priority as they sought the liberation from a rigid, essentialist, and somewhat misogynistic vision of Scottishness. Their agenda went hand in hand with the engagement of Scottish civil society after the unsuccessful home rule referendum and the victory of the Conservatives in 1979. As Scotland increasingly felt

marginalised within the UK political space, political frustration was channelled and served the assertion of Scottish identity. This paper thus explores the ramifications of the 1997 referendum which established a Scottish Parliament reportedly more in tune with the cultural and political aspirations of the nation.

**Prof. Edwige Camp-Pietrain, Université Polytechnique des Hauts-de-France (Valenciennes),
Economic nationalism in Scotland**

The SNP's nationalism is based on economic matters. Its leaders have always contended that Scotland should become independent in order to deal with its natural resources. Thanks to the discovery of oil they added that their nation could afford to be independent. This pledge remained essential in the campaign leading to the 2014 referendum on independence. Not only was it regarded as a threat by the British Government, but it also led to responses in the Northern isles.

Yet in 2021, SNP leaders have to adapt their discourse to substantial changes -*ie* the collapse in oil prices and the agreement with the Greens who are committed to getting rid of fossil fuels- as well as soaring public deficits resulting from Brexit and the Covid-19 pandemic. They find it increasingly difficult to devise a credible blueprint to be used for a second independence referendum.

Yet they still aim at promoting Scotland as a brand and at devising economic policies likely to attract immigrants and investors. Independence is regarded as a means for Scottish politicians to conduct their own policies, distinct from those led in "London".

My paper will focus on the economic nationalism promoted by the SNP as far as oil is concerned in a changing environment. It will rely on primary sources *ie* documents published by the SNP, by the Scottish Government as well as parliamentary debates held in the Scottish Parliament and in the House of Commons.

Mathew Nicolson, University of Edinburgh, 'These Groups of Islands are Different': Identity and Constitutional Change in Orkney and Shetland, 1966-90.

Between 1966 and 1990, Orkney and Shetland experienced multiple debates concerning their form of government and participation within British and Scottish constitutional structures. The discovery of North Sea oil in the early 1970s and resultant transformation of the social and economic fabric of the islands added fuel to these debates, contributing to the emergence of a greater Shetland and Orcadian political consciousness. Orkney and Shetland are often portrayed in the popular imagination as retaining strong Norse connections at the expense of a Scottish identity, a viewpoint which fails to appreciate the islands' historical development and multi-layered identities. Similarly, the actions of Orkney and Shetland's political leaders in this period have been characterised simplistically as the product of 'anti-Scottish' sentiment. Through an examination of this period's constitutional debates, a more nuanced analysis of Orkney and Shetland's identities can be developed.

My paper examines the role of identity in driving Orkney and Shetland's opposition to the Wheatley Commission's proposed Highlands Regional Council, their demands for safeguards within or even exclusion from a Scottish Assembly and the Orkney and Shetland Movements' campaigns for political autonomy. While these positions often emphasised arguments based on the islands' geography and distinct position with regard to oil developments, they were underpinned by strong local identities which both influenced and grew from debates on constitutional change. Rather than an inherent aversion to closer connections with Scotland or rejection of a Scottish identity, these developments should be understood as responses to a widespread sense of vulnerability and perceived threat towards the islands' local identities in a period of rapid economic, social and political change. Orkney and Shetland's responses to constitutional debates in this period offers an opportunity to develop a broader understanding of Scottish identity which acknowledges its heterogeneity and regional variation, particularly in the 'northern periphery.'

Dr. Paul Malgrati, University of Glasgow, The Political Uses of Robert Burns during the 2014 Indyref Campaign

It is often claimed that culture and literature, whilst crucial in the 1980-90s process of Scottish Devolution, played only a negligible part during the 2014 indyref campaign. Issues of identity, language, and emotions, it seemed, could not compete with the more pragmatic debate on Scottish constitution, oil, and currency. The present paper will nuance this view by studying uses of Robert Burns's poetry on both sides of the referendum debate. After summarising key aspects of the poet's reception in modern Scottish politics (from unionist to nationalist and socialist approaches), I will show that Burns featured rather prominently in 2012-2014 Scottish partisan discourse. Indeed, Scotland's bard — the country's most popular, historical figure — remained a key, controversial reference, capable of framing debates on Scottish nationhood. As a rather consensual, democratic, yet markedly Scottish icon, Burns's works fed the rhetoric of civic nationalism, adorning speeches by pro-independence leaders, including Alex Salmond and Jim Sillars. Likewise, despite a reluctance to use Scottish culture on the 'No' side, unionist politicians felt the need to appropriate Burns as a symbol of pan-British solidarity —as well as a reference proving their Scottish credentials. Following this, the second part of my presentation will analyse attempts at politicising Burns beyond partisan rhetoric. In contemporary arts and literature, for instance, the writers Liz Lochhead and Robert Crawford as well as the photographer Calum Colvin used Burns's poetry as a touchstone to address constitutional politics. Interestingly, Burns was also present at a more grassroots, diffuse level —especially within the 'Yes' movement— from demonstrations to material culture and on social media. Using Google Trends and YouTube records, I will evidence a significant, online surge of interest in Burns's songs during the last few months of the campaign. Certainly, whether Burns's message had any impact on the referendum result is uncertain. Yet, by emphasising the bardic colour of indyref, my presentation will testify to the unusually important role of poetry in Scotland's democratic culture.

Dr. Béatrice Duchateau, University of Burgundy (Dijon), Hugh MacDiarmid and Compton Mackenzie's MI5 personal files: was Scottish Nationalism irrelevant in the 1930s?

In 2005, under the Freedom of Information Act, the Secret Service personal files on the poet Hugh MacDiarmid (1892-1978) and the novelist Compton Mackenzie (1883-1972) were released. Both men made a name for themselves by writing works of literature and by being instrumental in the birth of the nationalist movement in Scotland at the end of the 1920s. The MI5 watched MacDiarmid from 1931 to 1943, even when he was living on the remote Shetland island of Whalsay, mostly because of his communist and nationalist activities. As for Mackenzie, a former intelligence officer during the First World War in Greece, he was kept under surveillance from the 1930s to the early 1950s, even if a resident of the far away Hebridean Isle of Barra. The reports on him focus mostly on the publication of his spy-novel *Greek Memories* (1932), for which he was trialed in 1933 for violation of the UK Official Secrets Act. From about 1918 to the late 1950s, it was common practice for the Security Service to watch British writers, MacDiarmid and Mackenzie making two interesting Scottish study cases. As communist and fascist allegiances were the core targets of the MI5 between the wars, could their nationalism have played a part too in this need to keep a good eye on them?

An exploration of the files shows that the cultural and political nationalism of MacDiarmid triggered a debate amongst the different secret officers as to the dangerous nature of the man's nationalist views whereas MacKenzie's nationalist activities were not even considered a threat. While commenting upon the MI5 files themselves, this paper will examine the reasons behind this hesitancy or sheer disregard for a potential nationalist threat. Drawing on research about the MI5 and the history of nationalism in Scotland between the wars, we will show that, even if incomplete and partial, these archives offer valuable insight into the UK government's response to the rise of cultural and political nationalism in Scotland in the 30s and 40s.

Dr. Lesley Graham, University of Bordeaux, Questions of Identity on the Stevenson trail in Scotland

This presentation aims to explore the questions of identity present in the travel accounts of a number of travellers who have visited Scotland on the trail of Robert Louis Stevenson since the late nineteenth century. They include Clayton Hamilton, Nicholas Rankin, Gavin Bell, and Ian Nimmo. Their primary objective in undertaking their journey is to (re)visit the townscapes and landscapes familiar to Stevenson, and perhaps to recapture something of his “spirit intense and rare”. They may also be keen to experience first-hand places familiar from works such as *Kidnapped* or *Edinburgh Picturesque Notes*, or to see the artefacts left behind by Stevenson in the homes and museums with which his name is associated. The accounts of these “second voyages” often combine biographical and autobiographical elements; their narratives shuttling between the present and the past calling into question the identities not only Robert Louis Stevenson and the writer following him but also that of the land itself.

Dr. Pauline Pilote, Université Bretagne Sud, Transatlantic Scott: the *Waverley Novels* and the transatlantic circulation of cultural perceptions

Walter Scott is commonly identified as the father of the historical fiction, his *Waverley Novels* meeting a tremendous success from their first publications and through their various reeditions. Widely read throughout the United Kingdom, Europe, and the United States of America, they helped to shape the cultural representation of Scotland for many readers from the 19th century until today and had a great role in the constitution of the Scottish collective memory within the wider United Kingdom. Yet, if Walter Scott is generally reckoned as a champion of Scottishness, the wide circulation of texts and ideas across the Atlantic in the 19th century pleads for a widening of the scope and a displacement of the representation of Scottish identity onto the transatlantic stage.

Because the popularity of the historical novel has been seen in the larger context of the assertion of nations and national primacy through the 19th century, this shaping of cultural representations and the construction of cultural identities has often been studied within a national frame. However, the importance of the transatlantic circulation of cultural perceptions and stereotypes can be perceived in the use of certain particular images, most notably in the later *Waverley Novels*. Even when he is dealing with Scotland and Scottish History, Scott borrows back images and vocabulary used by historical novelists from other countries, and most particularly American historical novelists who had been largely influenced by his *Waverley Novels*. In *Redgauntlet* (1824) and *The Fair Maid of Perth* (1828), Scott goes well beyond the hackneyed idea – taking its source in the 18th century – of existing similarities between Highlanders and Native Americans to incorporate in his historical novels about Scotland images commonly associated with Indians in the fictions of the time, but also more unexpected notions of independence, of frontier, etc., forcing us to see through a transnational lens the role of the historical novel in the shaping of Scottish cultural nationalism.

Dr. Anne-Lise Marin-Lamellet, Université Jean Monnet – Saint-Étienne, “This is Scotland, by Christ!”: Cultural Nationalism and National (Re)Branding in the Cinematic Adaptations of Irvine Welsh

In 1996, *Trainspotting* popularised a new image of Scotland on screen. Based on Irvine Welsh’s debut novel, it provocatively sent a whole century-old cultural tradition packing. The “Trainspotting effect” came to counter the “Braveheart effect” and was interpreted as a surge of anti-Thatcherite, self-deprecating anger throwing deindustrialised Leith in the faces of Highland lovers.

Because cinema is both art and industry, it deals with culture, politics but also economics and some might say *Trainspotting* – often imitated and rarely equated – simply launched a new trend or a niche genre that can nonetheless be resonant with times of increasingly post-national, globalised urban identity. “Star author” Irvine Welsh has certainly become a sort of Scottish brand himself that is useful to finance films in a nation that still struggles to have an industry of its own, let alone one that can or will express/sell Scottishness in what may be state-of-the-nation films catering both for local and international audiences.

However, all of Irvine Welsh’s film adaptations, whether directed by Scottish or English/foreign directors, show a consistent will to engage with Scottish identity, the evolution of Scotland and its future.

As mirrors of their context of production, they reflect the complexity of contemporary Scottish society and partake in its debates about self-definition. Far from wallowing in miserabilism and/or gratuitous childish provocation, they are evidence of an increasingly assertive, bold expression of a country/nation that has yet to become a state of its own but has gone beyond the mere will to cash in on clichés in order to attract tourists or please crowds by accepting to put forward its darker side in a self-confident way. Interestingly, this more self-defining view of Scottishness in a post-devolutionary era also fits in perfectly with age-old traits of that nation. Welsh's adaptations thus appear as a major contribution to a new form of Scottish cultural nationalism, presenting a more diverse and multifaceted national identity in a transnational context/environment.



Scottish Parliamentary elections took place on 6 May 2021 and, with the victory of the Scottish National Party (SNP), there may be a mandate for a second referendum on independence. This quest for national political identity coincides with wider trends in nationalism, both cultural and political, and exhibits both parallels and marked contrasts within different contexts: thus the question of how culture interplays with politics, in the context of nationalism, is both topical and controversial.

'Cultural nationalism' arguably seeks to present a coherent vision of a nation's identity, history and destiny. It is often associated with social, cultural and political crises, and especially with the advent of modernity. In contrast to the medieval Church's universalism, and the Enlightenment's emphasis on rationality and cosmopolitanism, it was the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries which saw a resurgence of interest in historical and cultural particularity.

Cultural nationalism more widely, and its relationship with political nationalism, has been intensely debated by historians and sociologists (including Ernest Gellner, Eric Hobsbawm, Terrence Ranger, Benedict Anderson, Hans Kohn, Miroslav Hroch, Anthony D. Smith and John Hutchinson).

We propose, here, to explore how and why cultural nationalism has (or has not) coincided with political nationalism in the history of Scotland. What are the historical roots of Scotland's contemporary cultural and political identities? How have cultural and political expressions of 'Scottishness' developed over time? And how do they relate to Scotland's constitution, administration and economy, past and present?

By looking at the relationship between political and cultural nationalism from medieval to contemporary times, this conference — the 20th Congress of the French Society for Scottish Studies — affords the opportunity for social, political and economic historians, cultural and literary scholars, and historians of art and architecture to engage in what today is clearly a very relevant and topical discussion.

We are delighted to welcome all our participants, and Prof. Ian Brown, Prof. Tom Devine and Dominic Grieve QC as our keynote speakers.

Organiser: Dr. Clarisse Godard Desmarest
<https://sfeecorpus.sciencesconf.org/>

